

Fourth Report on Decolonising the Curriculum (DtC) at DUBS: Audit of Research Output and Policy Implications for Research-Led Curriculum and Research

Seyi Omonitan, Faculty Student Intern for DtC 2021-22 and

Laura Marsiliani, Faculty EDI Co-Lead (Race and Ethnicity)

July 2022

1. Background

Following the literature review and the findings of the student questionnaire and staff consultations contained in our First and Second Reports on Decolonising the Curriculum at DUBS (See Omonitan et al. 2021 and Omonitan and Marsiliani 2022a), it was decided the next focus would be on the DUBS research output. The reason is twofold. First across Durham University, we adopt a research-lead teaching approach that is also informed by members of staff own research; thus, understanding whether issues related to race, ethnicity, diverse culture, Global South are well represented in the research output of DUBS can provide a signal of whether these issues are also embedded in our curriculum. Secondly Durham University is currently undertaking a project on Decolonising the University (that is beyond the curriculum) and the Race Equality Charter audit and assessment both including research activities.

The definition adopted at DUBS of Decolonising the Curriculum provided us with a clear focus for our search:

“For the Business school DtC means understanding how the predominant focus on the Global North has impacted the way we view systems of accounting, economics, finance, management and marketing and therefore working towards critically analysing norms from the Global North and creating degree programmes more inclusive of knowledge and practices from the Global South.”

Therefore, we focused on outputs covering issues of Global South (including on all non-western countries and encompassing related themes of diverse culture and norms) and Race and Ethnicity (and related themes of diverse cultures and norms).

2. Methodology

An audit of 304 research articles available online on DRO was conducted between March and June 2022. This number was selected to obtain a representative sample, of around 10% of the total population. As of June 2022, the Business School had 3044 research articles on its online database. A random number generator was used to extract the sample. We then analysed each output to identify relevant information on contents and references. Our focus was on output dealing with Global South and Race and Ethnicity issues. We also checked whether authors were of BAME background (from individual surnames and information contained on websites) and whether references quoted included BAME authors (from individual surnames

and information contained on websites). Notice that we did not focus on research quality for this report.

3. Results

i) Low overall level of research on Race and Ethnicity and Global South issues

Only 18% of research focused on Race and Ethnicity and Global South issues at DUBS.

ii) Research on Global South issues focuses on specific themes and regions

23% of articles on Global South issues focused on Islamic finance. 26% of research articles either focused on South Asia and China- specific issues or used evidence from the two countries, compared to just 5% of research articles using evidence from Sub-Saharan Africa

iii) Stronger focus on Global South issues than Race and Ethnicity issues

Only one research article in the sample focused on Race and Ethnicity issues in the Business School, compared to 56 research articles on Global South issues.

iv) High number of BAME authors

41% of relevant research articles were written by at least one DUBS BAME author. This reflects the high internationalization of DUBS. 88% of all research articles focused on Race and Ethnicity and Global South issues were written by at least one BAME author. This illustrates a clear drive from BAME researchers to investigate issues of the Global South.

v) Diverse references

Outputs focusing on issues related to Global South and Race and Ethnicity included references from authors identified as BAME and/or from the Global South.

vi) Departmental differences

From our sample, we ascertained the following. The Economics Department had the most research articles focused on Global South issues. These research articles were primarily centred around China and South Asia. The Accounting Department and the Finance Department had the second-most research articles focused on Global South issues. These were primarily centred around Islamic finance and accounting and consequently primarily focusing on Islamic countries. While the Business and Management departments produced the only research article centred around issues of Race and Ethnicity, it had a relatively low number of research articles focused on Global South issues. The Marketing department had the lowest number of research articles focused on either Race or Ethnicity or Global South issues.

These results are not surprising when we benchmark them against the respective disciplines. For example, according to Advani et al. (2021) only 2% of all outputs in Economics deals with issues of Race and Ethnicity, compared with 12% in Sociology. The results are in line with the overall trend in the respective disciplines.

4. Conclusion and policy implications

From the above results we have identified the following implications for research and research-led T&L at DUBS:

- **An opportunity for DUBS to lead on research-led curriculum on Global-South and Race and Ethnicity issues.**

Decolonising the curriculum has primarily emerged in Anglo-Saxon universities, therefore DUBS is well positioned to lead on this in Europe and beyond.

From our analysis it is expected that under-representation of research outputs on issues of Race and Ethnicity and Global South translates into low representation of these same issues in the curriculum. Thus, dealing with such a situation may lead to positive outcomes. First, it may result in students not to feel detached from the curriculum; the analysis of our student questionnaire suggests that students of Afro-Caribbean background feel detached from our curriculum especially as research on Africa is not well represented. Furthermore, it may lower the risk and trade-offs related to introducing those topics in teaching activities; staff consultation has revealed those are of high concern for staff. Besides, introducing those topics in the curriculum may enhance the importance of conducting research on those issues and foster further research outputs from members of staff. Finally, exposing students to these topics in the curriculum may encourage those who wish to explore these topics at master and/or PhD level, creating another opportunity to foster further research on these issues.

Several policies can be investigated such as:

- a) Ensure that existing modules dealing with research issues related to Global South and Race and Ethnicity are available to students each year.
 - b) Foster the development of new research-led modules and programmes embedding Global South and Race and Ethnicity issues in the curriculum.
 - c) Incentivise the inclusion of research on Global South and Race and Ethnicity issues in the curriculum as this can create positive spinoffs in terms of academic staff's research output and inspire future researchers.
 - d) Promote the best practice of inviting guest-lecturers researching on relevant issues and of BAME backgrounds.
- **An opportunity for DUBS to lead on research on Global-South and Race and Ethnicity issues.**

Currently, these research fields are relatively under-represented in the disciplines typically included in Business Schools (Accounting, Economics, Finance, Management and Marketing).

By fostering research on those issues, DUBS may gain a first-mover advantage and lead among peers.

Several policies can be investigated such as:

- a) Incentivise research on Race and Ethnicity through scholarships, prizes, rewards creation of new research centres, tailored research events etc. Extra financial incentives may be needed to cover the additional costs of undertaking research based on Global South issues (travel, data collection etc.).
- b) From the analysis conducted in this audit, outputs on sub-Saharan Africa are significantly under-represented, therefore extra effort can be devoted to research and research collaboration opportunities on this region.
- c) It transpires that BAME authors have a drive to explore issues related to Global South issues. Therefore, it is expected that increasing the proportion of BAME researchers at DUBS may increase the number of outputs dealing with those issues.

References

Advani, A., Ash, E. Cai, D. and Rasul I. (2021) Race-related research in economics and other social sciences. CAGE working paper no. 565, University of Warwick, May 2021

Omonitan S., Marsiliani L. and M. Learmonth (2021). *First Report on Decolonising the Curriculum at DUBS: Designing the Student Questionnaire and Staff Consultation*. Durham University Business School, November 2021.

Omonitan S. and L. Marsiliani (2022a). *Second Report on Decolonising the Curriculum at DUBS: Results of the Student Questionnaire and Staff Consultation and Policy Implications*. Durham University Business School. February 2022.

Appendix

Raw data from Excel (file available upon request)

[illegible]

Addison	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2018.04.005	Yes	No	Yen, D. et al.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.09.005	Yes	Yes	Das, S. et al.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.04.005	No	Yes	Fosu, A. et al.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	Yes
Ahmed, M.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	Yes	Abdelsalam, A.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	Yes	Milewski, P.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Basu, P.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
O'Connor, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Jones, D.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Chen, X.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	McLean, P.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Coolen, H.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Warwick, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Siedlok, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	Yes	Liu, R. et al.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No
Hansen, K.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Banerjee, S.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	Yes	He, G. et al.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Vesperoni, M.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Philip, D.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Das, S. et al.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	Yes	Mawson, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	McMurren, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
van Delle, A.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Milewski, P.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Cai, C.X.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Slack, R.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Harding, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Chen, X.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Andersson, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	Yes	Frey, D.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Van der Ven, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Siedlok, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	Yes	Cozzi, G.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Laffin, M.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Baldwin, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	He, G. et al.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Alexandri, A.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Ugur, M.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Schyns, P.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Mawson, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Antoniou, A.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Aroles, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Ruijun, E.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Ding, S.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	Yes	Othman, M.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	Yes	Mencarelli, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Adams, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Li, D.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Mrad, M.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Andreou, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Aroles, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Learmonth, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Carvalho, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	Yes	Cozzi, G.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Thompson, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Schyns, P.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Chambers, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Lin, Z. et al.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No
Snowdon, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Moore, G.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Snap, E.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Schyns, P.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Tonin, S.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Ning, L.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	Yes	Moore, G.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Learmonth, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Toth-Bodnar, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Bozionel, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Cosar, A.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Zhao, Y.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	Yes
Nepal, R.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Mawson, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Grenier, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Carroll, C.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No
Mawson, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Laffin, M.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Daly, S.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No	Andersen, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No
Li, J. et al.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	Yes	Al-Sador, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Renström, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	No	No				
He, T. et al.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No	Gyimah, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	No								
				Banerjee, S.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2017.03.005	Yes	Yes								

Schwartz, R.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/1822/	No	No
Chow, D.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/1677/	Yes	No
Blackburn, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/16468/	No	No
Andersen, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/10350/	No	No
Hsu, G. Z.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/1650/	Yes	No
Nagengast, A.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/31094/	Yes	No
Damian, C.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/27456/	No	No
Tawiah, A.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/35798/	Yes	Yes
Fortin, M.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/400/	No	No
Newbold, P.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/276/	No	No

Escobar, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/14566/	No	No
Shukla, I.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/25615/	No	No
Ogundipe, A.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/34675/	Yes	No
Saha, B.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/24691/	Yes	Yes
Mawson, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/7038/	No	No
Harvey, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/238/	No	No
Stone, I.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/6364/	No	No
Denedo, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/23496/	Yes	Yes
Sencal, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/32058/	Yes	Yes
Chaudhry, A.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/32621/	Yes	No
Halberstam, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/31159/	No	No
Moore, G.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/507/	No	No

Broderick, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/1610/	No	No
Coolen, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/12605/	No	No
Oliveira, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/7967/	No	No
Marchini, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/783/	No	No
Mazzi, F.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/27469/	No	No
Zhang, Z.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/273/	Yes	Yes
Tadajew, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/14036/	No	No
Baldwin, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/28278/	Yes	Yes
Harrison, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/472/	No	No
Roberts, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/636/	No	No
Ashurst, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/714/	No	No
Bligh, M.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/781/	No	No
Kargar, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/32877/	Yes	No

Andreou, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/17156/	No	No
Brei, V. C.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/14043/	No	No
Sutherland, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/17561/	No	Yes
Foti, R. J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/22461/	No	No
Schyns, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/781/	No	No
Damjanc, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/28544/	No	No
Slack, R.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/11565/	No	No
Platonov, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/19221/	Yes	Yes
Andreou, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/32391/	No	No
Levant, F.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/19412/	No	No

Levant, F.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/19412/	No	No
Oliveira, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/35313/	Yes	Yes
Aroles, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/29755/	No	No
Mohamm, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/29755/	Yes	Yes
Ferry, L.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/19373/	No	No
Hayes, M.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/18199/	No	No
Brandl, E.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/26440/	No	No
Smith, H.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/17080/	No	No
Chow, D.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/28061/	Yes	No
Williams, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/299/		
Ebrahim, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/15164/	Yes	Yes
Abdelsa, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/17448/	Yes	Yes
Anbar, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/26033/	Yes	No
Ghadge, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/33834/	Yes	No
Howorth, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/42801/	No	No
Geng, S.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/14268/	Yes	No
Abouras, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/18176/	Yes	No
Hole, A.F.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/20333/	No	No
Ebrahim, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/15031/	Yes	Yes
Damian, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/23009/	No	No

Savaget, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/29094/	Yes	No
Kyriakop, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/16059/	No	No
Cox, C. E.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/33690/	Yes	No
Gregory, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/27803/	No	No
Baiocchi, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/277/	No	No
Williams, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/22967/	Yes	Yes
Chapman, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/26254/	No	No
Lamberti, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/557/	No	No
Addison, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/15750/	No	No
Aldhahe, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/22940/	Yes	No
Sousa, C.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/12413/	No	No
Mallett, C.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/9854/	No	No
Lee, Z. V.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/24152/	Yes	No
Fakhrun, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/26662/	Yes	No
Amin, S.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/35378/	Yes	Yes
Brandl, E.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/28102/	No	No
Nucciare, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/21127/	Yes	No
Akkas, E.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/34900/	Yes	Yes
Moermar, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/12042/	No	No
Schyns, J.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/25611/	No	No
Wang, Y.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/23373/	Yes	Yes
Ferry, L.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/30152/	No	No
Ferry, L.	https://ro.dur.ac.uk/19379/	No	No

Scholes, J. A.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Hu, N. and Baransk	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Demirci, C.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Skarmes, A.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No
Amaeshi, A.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Baransk, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	Yes	Wright, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Renström, M.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Allinson, S.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Chatterjee, S.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Yan, J. and Epitropa	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	Yes		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Xu, Y. and Wijbenga	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Ning, L.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	Yes	Galariti	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Koutmos, G.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	Yes	Saha, B.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	Yes	Morrell, I.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Aparicio, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Gu, X. and Ghafran	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	Yes	Whittle, S.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Wang, X.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Barelids, P.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Schyns, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Hou, Y. and Chau, F.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Perrett, F.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Chau, F.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
				Ferry, L.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Ouyang, C.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Nguyen, T.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	Yes	Guan, Y.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	Yes	Cheng, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Della Giua	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Damjanovic	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Vincent, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Wilson, I.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Chu, I. and Ford, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Walker, S.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Saha, B.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	Yes	Liao, Zhi	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Benbya, S.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Savaget, P.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Addison, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Meng, Y.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Greenbaum	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Zhang, C.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Learmor, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Sollis, R.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Marstanc	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Addison, J.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
Filieri, R.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No	Sousa, C.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Zhou, B.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
				Tobiasse	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	He, G. and Tóth, Ág	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
				Buckner	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No	Epitropa	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	No	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
								Zhang, Z.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
								Nguyen, T.	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006	Yes	No		https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		
													https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2018.06.006		